RESEARCH ON TECHNICAL AND VOCATIONAL SKILLS FACILITATING INTEGRATION INTO THE LABOUR MARKET

CURRENT SITUATION, LIMITATIONS AND FUTURE OUTLOOK IN THREE WEST AFRICAN COUNTRIES (Burkina Faso, Côte d’Ivoire and Ghana)

François-Joseph Azoh (ERNWACA, Côte d’Ivoire)
Frédérique Weyer (NORRAG, Switzerland)
Michel Carton (NORRAG, Switzerland)

February 2012
The present study was carried out by ERNWACA (Educational Research Network for West and Central Africa) in collaboration with NORRAG (Network for Policy Research, Review and Advice on Education and Training), with the support of the SDC (Swiss Development Cooperation).

It was prepared for and presented at the Association for the Development of Education in Africa (ADEA) Triennale Meeting which was held in Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso, in February 2012.

NORRAG (Network for Policy Research, Review and Advice on Education and Training) is a focus and a forum for the analysis of international cooperation in the education and training field – www.norrag.org

ERNWACA (Educational Research Network for West and Central Africa) aims at increasing research capacity, strengthening collaboration among researchers and practitioners, and promoting African expertise on education so as to positively impact educational practices and policies – www.ernwaca.org
ABSTRACT

Africa is seeing a renewed interest in technical and vocational skills development (TVSD). Before efficient youth employment policies can be set out and implemented for both urban and rural areas, however, reliable data and analysis must be available.

This study will focus on TVSD. It aims to present a survey of the TVSD-related research conducted by various stakeholder groups over the course of the past twenty years, while also identifying the research expectations, needs and demands expressed by those stakeholders and ascertaining which research topics are in most urgent need of attention. This paper is based on three case studies carried out in Burkina Faso, Côte d’Ivoire and Ghana. In addition, for the purposes of comparison and idea sharing, two similar studies were carried out in South Africa and Latin America. We also draw upon an analytical study of the situation in West Africa concerning research on education and training.

The findings of the West African study show, firstly, that commissioned research clearly dominates the output on TVSD. Secondly, research agencies and consultants are the main producers of research. Thirdly, academic contributors are in a minority. Fourthly, the most frequently tackled topics are those which link directly to policies and programmes being implemented by the commissioning entities. Fifthly, economics is the most frequently adopted research approach.

There is a patent gap between, on the one hand, the research available and, on the other, the priority areas identified in interviews with TVSD stakeholders. The priority areas relate to institutional management, demand analysis, improved understanding of the informal and agriculture sectors, the development of more context-appropriate curricula and graduate labour-market entry.

One way to reduce this breach is to facilitate academic research. Comparison with Latin America and South Africa, where more academic research is produced, reveals that, as against the commissioned research conducted by research agencies and consultancies, this type of research offers a higher potential for:

- Taking into account the multi-faceted nature of TVSD, which means that analysis of it requires a multi-disciplinary approach;
- Adding to and/or reassessing the quantitative data on offer by producing stakeholder- and practice-centred qualitative information, which reveals how programmes and policies are implemented, how they affect recipients and how they are appropriated;
- Improving knowledge of all too frequently neglected areas such as the informal and agriculture sectors;
- Appropriating international discourse and policies, for only a stable research community which is able to regenerate itself can contribute to these in a pertinent and historically grounded fashion and adapt them for use at the national level;
- Carrying out a critical analysis of the assumptions upon which policies and programmes are based, which allows them to be regenerated.
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of tables and figures</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of acronyms and abbreviations</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>METHOD</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SURVEY OF RESEARCH CARRIED OUT OVER THE COURSE OF THE PAST 20 YEARS</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researchers</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Determinants of research output</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topics addressed</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research approaches</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research trends over the past 20 years</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RESEARCH EXPECTATIONS, NEEDS AND DEMANDS</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRIORITY RESEARCH FOCUSES AND PREREQUISITES</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCES</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX : Documents consulted for each study</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documents consulted in Burkina Faso</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documents consulted in Côte d’Ivoire</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documents consulted in Ghana</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of tables and figures

Table 1: Distribution of demographic data by country 9
Table 2: HDI ranking by country, out of a total of 177 countries, across three years 10
Table 3: Distribution of lower secondary students (Junior High School) across the public and private sectors in Ghana (2003-2010) 11
Graph 1: Distribution of researchers in Côte d’Ivoire 14
Graph 2: Determinants of research output in Côte d’Ivoire 15
Table 4: Distribution of sample studies dating from 1990 to 2010 in Burkina Faso by topic 16
Graph 3: Distribution of topics focused upon in Côte d’Ivoire by type of researcher 17
Graph 4: Disciplinary approaches in research in Côte d’Ivoire 18
Graph 5: Distribution of research approaches by stakeholder group in Côte d’Ivoire 18
Table 5: Research output in Burkina Faso (number of studies) by five-year period from 1990 to 2010 19
Graph 6: Research topics and their development in Côte d’Ivoire 20
Table 6: Distribution of priority research areas in Burkina Faso 23
Table 7: Distribution of priority research areas in Ghana 24
Table 8: Distribution of priority research areas in Côte d’Ivoire 25
**List of acronyms and abbreviations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABGRH</td>
<td>Association Burkinabé de Gestionnaires des Ressources Humaines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFD</td>
<td>French International Cooperation Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AGEPE</td>
<td>Agence d'Etude et de Promotion de l'Emploi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANPE</td>
<td>Agence Nationale Pour l'Emploi (National Employment Agency)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APNEF</td>
<td>Association pour la Promotion de l’Éducation Non Formelle (Association for the promotion of non formal education)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BAC</td>
<td>Baccalauréat (secondary school diploma)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BECE</td>
<td>Basic Education Certificate Examination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEP</td>
<td>Brevet d’Études Professionnelles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEPC</td>
<td>Brevet d’Étude du Premier Cycle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BT</td>
<td>Brevet de Technicien</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BTS</td>
<td>Brevet de Technicien Supérieur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAP</td>
<td>Certificat d’Aptitude Professionnelle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBL</td>
<td>Competency Based Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBT</td>
<td>Competency Based Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCI</td>
<td>Chambre de Commerce et d’Industrie (Chamber of Commerce)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEBNF</td>
<td>Centre d’Éducation de Base Non Formelle (Center for non formal basic education)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEPE</td>
<td>Certificat d’Étude Primaire Elémentaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CERFODES</td>
<td>Centre d’Études, de Recherches et de Formation pour le Développement Économique et Social (Study, research and training centre for economic and social development)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CGTB</td>
<td>Confédération Générale du Travail du Burkina</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COTVET</td>
<td>Council for Technical and Vocational Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPAF</td>
<td>Centre Permanent d’Alphabétisation Fonctionnelle (Permanent center for functional literacy)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFP</td>
<td>Direction de la Formation Professionnelle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EFA</td>
<td>Education for All</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENAM</td>
<td>Ecole Nationale d’Administration et de Magistrature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENAREF</td>
<td>Ecole Nationale des Régies Financières</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENEP</td>
<td>Ecole Nationale des Enseignements du Primaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENS</td>
<td>Ecole Normale Supérieure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENSK</td>
<td>Ecole Normale Supérieure de Koudougou</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ENSP</td>
<td>Ecole Nationale de Santé Publique</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERWACA</td>
<td>Educational Research Network for West and Central Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAFPA</td>
<td>Fonds d’Appui à la Formation Professionnelle et à l’Apprentissage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDFP</td>
<td>Fonds de Développement de la Formation Professionnelle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GES</td>
<td>Ghana Education Service</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GIZ</td>
<td>German International Cooperation Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICCES</td>
<td>Integrated Community Centres for Employable Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFAD</td>
<td>International Fund for Agricultural Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPNETP</td>
<td>Institut Pédagogique National de l’Enseignement Technique et Professionnel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISIG</td>
<td>Institut des Sciences de l’Informatique et de Gestion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JERARE</td>
<td>Journal of Educational Research in Africa/Revue Africaine de Recherche en Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JICA</td>
<td>Japan International Cooperation Agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MATDS</td>
<td>Ministère de l’Administration Territoriale, de la Décentralisation et de la Sécurité</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEBF</td>
<td>Maison de l’Entreprise du Burkina Faso</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENA</td>
<td>Ministère de l’Éducation Nationale et de l’Alphabétisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MESRS</td>
<td>Ministère de l’Enseignement Supérieur et de la Recherche Scientifique</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MESS</td>
<td>Ministère des Enseignements Secondaire et Supérieur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MESSRS</td>
<td>Ministère des Enseignements Secondaire et Supérieur et de la Recherche Scientifique</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>METFP</td>
<td>Ministère de l’Enseignement Technique et de la Formation Professionnelle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MJEFP</td>
<td>Ministère de la Jeunesse, de la Formation Professionnelle et de l’Emploi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoESS</td>
<td>Ministry of Education, Science and Sports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MoMYE</td>
<td>Ministry of Manpower, Youth and Employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NACVET</td>
<td>National Coordinating Committee on Technical and Vocational Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NTVETQF</td>
<td>National TVET Qualifications Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NVTI</td>
<td>National Vocational Training Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OIC</td>
<td>Opportunities Industrialization Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ONEF</td>
<td>Observatoire National de l'Emploi et de la Formation Professionnelle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PESPR</td>
<td>Preliminary Education Sector Performance Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNE</td>
<td>Politique Nationale de l’Emploi (National employment policy)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PNEFTP</td>
<td>Politique Nationale de l’Enseignement et de la Formation Techniques et Professionnels (National technical and vocational education and training policy)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTF</td>
<td>Partenaires Techniques et Financiers (technical and financial partners)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTI</td>
<td>Private Training Institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAP</td>
<td>Structural Adjustment Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SP/CNC - PF</td>
<td>Secrétariat Permanent de la Commission Nationale de la Certification et des Programmes de Formation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVE</td>
<td>Technical and Vocational Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVEP</td>
<td>Technical &amp; Vocational Education Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVET</td>
<td>Technical and Vocational Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TVSD</td>
<td>Technical and Vocational Skills Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDP</td>
<td>United Nations Development Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WAEC</td>
<td>West African Examinations Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WASSCE</td>
<td>West African Senior Secondary Certificate Examination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WTE</td>
<td>West African Examinations Council Technical Examination</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

This study focuses on research relating to technical and vocational skills development (TVSD). The present report is based on three case studies carried out in Burkina Faso, Côte d’Ivoire and Ghana. In addition, for the purposes of comparison and idea sharing, two similar studies were carried out in South Africa and Latin America; the text below will make reference to these two studies. A further source is an analysis of the West African situation where education- and training-related research is concerned.1 These studies, as well as the initial version of this report, were produced under the aegis of preparations for the Trienniale of the Association for the Development of Education in Africa (ADEA) held in Ouagadougou in February 2012.2

Burkina Faso, Côte d’Ivoire and Ghana are West African countries. They are geographically close to one another and share borders, but are set apart by linguistic differences: Ghana is English-speaking, unlike French-speaking Burkina Faso and Côte d’Ivoire. All three countries report an average annual demographic growth rate of around 2.8%, with a high proportion of individuals aged under 15 (Table 1). A significant proportion of their populations dwell in rural areas, particularly in Burkina Faso, where the percentage was higher than 80% in 2004.

Table 1: Distribution of demographic data by country

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Total population (million)</th>
<th>Urban population (%) of total</th>
<th>Population aged under 15 (%) of total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>17.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Côte d’Ivoire</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>17.9</td>
<td>21.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>21.7</td>
<td>26.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The level of development reported by the United Nations Development Programme’s (UNDP) composite Human Development Index (HDI) categorises Ghana as having a medium level of human development, while a low level of human development is ascribed to both Burkina Faso and Côte d’Ivoire (Table 2). In Côte d’Ivoire, household living conditions are worsening, with a poverty rate that rose from 33.6% in 1998 to 48.9% in 2008. Women and young people are the worst affected.

---


2 The study coordinators offer their sincere thanks to ADEA, the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation, the research teams in Burkina Faso, Côte d’Ivoire and Ghana as well as Latin America and South Africa, and the key resource teams who assisted with data collection.
Table 2: HDI ranking by country, out of a total of 177 countries, across three years

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>Change in ranking 2006-2009</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Côte d’Ivoire</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>+2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Human Development Report, UNDP, 2006, 2009*

These countries’ governments have made a number of investments with a view to bolstering school enrolment and literacy levels. From 1991 to 2006, the net primary-school enrolment rate increased from 29% to 45% in Burkina Faso, from 45% to 62% in Côte d’Ivoire and from 54% to 75% in Ghana. However, the levels achieved for this level of education still fall considerably short of the Education For All (EFA) targets. In terms of secondary education (all courses), the gross enrolment rate has also increased: from 14% in 2000 to 29% in 2010 in Burkina Faso, from 29% in 2000 to 32.4% in 2007 in Côte d’Ivoire, and from 60% in 2000 to 78% in 2009 in Ghana.

These efforts were undermined by the economic crisis which affected Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs) in the 1980s, the social crisis in the 1990s and climate-related uncertainty in the 2000s, which weakened both the education system and the rate of development of the countries’ economies. Meanwhile, a number of social and political crises have seriously affected the economy and employment in Côte d’Ivoire since 2002.

In Burkina Faso and Côte d’Ivoire, the majority of training programmes are offered by the private sector, while the public-sector offering remains weak: the ratio is 73% to 27% in Burkina Faso, for instance. Public-sector supply is also weak in Côte d’Ivoire, where the public-sector system for technical and vocational education and training (TVET) does not help access, providing only 69,000 places to a total 478,964 potential enrolments, a ratio of 1:6. This low capacity is due to a shortfall in the operating budget which persists despite the government’s efforts to counter it. Thus, the 2006 TVET budget stood at 8% of the overall education budget in Burkina Faso, 6% in Côte d’Ivoire and 4% in Ghana (UNESCO, 2007).

In Côte d’Ivoire, demand for public-sector training was very high in 2006-2007 (DPS/METFP, 2008), and came from four cohorts: (i) 251,152 young people who had not completed their primary education, (ii) 106,973 young people who had left school at the end of primary education or during the first level of general secondary education, (iii) 50,840 young people who left at the end of the first level or during the second level of general secondary education, and (iv) 50,000 ex-combatants and 20,000 ex-militia who fought during the crisis of 2002 (Schuh, Koné et Tano, 2010). The last two figures may have increased as a result of the post-electoral crisis which occurred in 2011.

Meanwhile, in the case of lower secondary education in Ghana (Junior High School), which comprises both general courses and technical and vocational ones, the majority of the student population is enrolled on public-sector courses (Table 3). Furthermore, the number of enrolments is constantly on the increase, even though supply falls short of demand on the labour market.
Table 3: Distribution of lower secondary students (Junior High School) across the public and private sectors in Ghana (2003-2010)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator/Year</th>
<th>2003/04</th>
<th>2004/05</th>
<th>2005/06</th>
<th>2006/07</th>
<th>2007/06</th>
<th>2008/09</th>
<th>2009/10</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Enrolments</td>
<td>919,334</td>
<td>1,010,246</td>
<td>1,041,002</td>
<td>1,132,318</td>
<td>1,132,318</td>
<td>1,285,577</td>
<td>1,301,940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public-sector Enrolments</td>
<td>773,982</td>
<td>822,205</td>
<td>883,060</td>
<td>952,151</td>
<td>952,151</td>
<td>1,064,088</td>
<td>1,075,036</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private-sector Enrolments</td>
<td>145,352</td>
<td>188,041</td>
<td>157,942</td>
<td>180,167</td>
<td>180,167</td>
<td>221,489</td>
<td>226,906</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Republic of Ghana, 2011

All three countries have undergone multiple reforms seeking to improve the quality and quantity of the training on offer. In Côte d’Ivoire, however, education and training policies are characterised by a degree of incoherence which prevents the graduate employment targets established in various vocational training development plans from being achieved. The problems encountered include (i) training courses and programmes which are out of step with economic needs; (ii) pedagogical and technical resources which are out of date and inappropriate; (iii) training provision which is behind the times, offers only low capacity and is unequally distributed; and (iv) insufficient enrolments and irregular distribution of students in terms of gender and course (Schuh et al., 2010).

In spite of the measures taken in terms of education and training, unemployment rates remain significant. Schuh et al.’s (2010) critical threshold of 20% unemployment is respected in Ghana. In Côte d’Ivoire, however, unemployment exceeds this threshold among those with the following qualifications: the BEP (53%), the BTS (42%), the BAC (27%), the Maîtrise (Master’s degree) (25%) and the CEPE (22%). For other qualifications, the unemployment rate stands beneath the critical threshold: the Licence (undergraduate degree) (19%), the BEPC (16%), the BT (13%) and the CAP (13%). At least two factors serve to explain these unemployment rates: (i) training profiles are poorly tailored to businesses’ needs where qualified employees are concerned; and (ii) the education system is more geared towards training managers, whereas the production sector has a greater need for specialised manual workers with the CAP or the BT.

This explains the current resurgence in interest in TVSD. At the international and regional levels, numerous organisations, such as UNCTAD, the ILO, the IFAD, the World Bank, the G20, the African Union and the African Development Bank have stressed the importance of this field. At the national level, meanwhile, numerous African countries have recently established policies which seek to broaden access to training and improve its quality.

The Trienniale of the ADEA has shown a shift in perspective from technical and vocational education and training (TVET) to TVSD: a broader vision of training has been embraced, to include skills developed outside the formal training system, and particularly those acquired through on-the-job training, non-formal programmes and family-based learning.

In spite of the above, before efficient youth employment policies can be set out and implemented for both urban and rural areas, reliable data and analysis on TVSD must be available. Bearing in mind the factors described above, what is the current situation regarding TVSD research? How can research in the field inform political decision-making? How can it assist with graduate employment?
In general terms, research has to contend with a dire set of circumstances in Africa. The Lagos Conference (1980) recommended that governments dedicate 1% of GDP to research, but this level has never been achieved, with very low levels of public funds being allotted to research activity (0.05% of GDP in Côte d’Ivoire in 2010). The funds allocated to this sector mainly benefit research on agriculture, with a view to ensuring food security, and to health. This leaves other research areas, and especially the social sciences, in a state of neglect, while public-sector universities’ research centres and institutes are unable to function properly. Scarcely any funds are available to encourage and promote researchers’, and particularly younger researchers’, work. Research on education is currently not, therefore, a very attractive sector.

Research on education and training (whether public- or private-sector, national or regional) began in the 1960s in the new universities. Then, following a wider decline in research in the social sciences, it tried to accommodate the demands of stakeholders in international cooperation, who were driving the education-policy developments outlined above. As early as the mid-1990s, research on education was already considered to be “neglected and under-rated” (ERNWACA, 1997). Consultancy and individual research efforts therefore stole a march on institution-based research, and this led to the under-fulfilment of national and regional priorities. One response came in the form of the establishing of networks, but a number of weaknesses nonetheless arose from the situation described above.

In light of all of this, the goals of this study are:

- To document the research carried out on TVSD over the course of the past 20 years in Burkina Faso, Côte d’Ivoire and Ghana;
- To identify the research expectations, needs and demands expressed by various TVSD stakeholders;
- To establish realistic priority areas for future research.
METHOD

This section looks at the places where data were collected, the population used in our research, the data-collection techniques and tools adopted and the methods of analysis employed for the West African case studies.

The study was mainly carried out in the countries’ capital cities, where almost 75% of decision-making structures and training and research institutions are to be found. The population included in our survey was made up of:

- Decision-makers involved in national education policies; these were inspectors and directors of central administrations at the various ministries involved in education and training;
- (Public- and private-sector) development partners in the field of education and training. These were the World Bank, the GTZ (GiZ), the ILO, the UNDP, the French Development Agency (Agence française de développement, AFD), national training and employment agencies and NGOs;3
- Research centres and institutions;
- Education-policy recipients and training providers; these were ‘modern’ employers, chambers of commerce, professional associations and trade unions.

The survey used purposive sampling. Participants were selected on the basis of their role and level of experience so as to garner relevant and high-quality data.

Two data-collection techniques were favoured, namely documentary research and interviews. Documentary research focused mainly on documents archived over the past 20 years in documentation and information centres, and in particular such centres in the organisations to which the survey participants belonged. Further documents were collected from key resource persons. Our documentary research involved collecting theses, dissertations, papers and other publications produced by researchers, study coordinators, administrators and education managers. 307 documents were collected overall, with 151 coming from Burkina Faso, 36 from Côte d’Ivoire and 120 Ghana for the 20-year period stretching from 1991 to 2011.

The aim of the interviews was to document stakeholders’ knowledge of research on TVSD and analyse their research expectations, needs and demands. The list of research areas identified in the interviews was confirmed and expanded by means of an open workshop which brought together the main TVSD stakeholders in each country.

3 It is worth noting that the political crisis which occurred in Côte d’Ivoire in 2011 had an impact on data collection as the offices of some international organisations, such as UNDP, were temporarily closed.
The survey of research on TVSD carried out over the past twenty years is divided into the following sections: researchers, determinants of research output, topics, approaches and trends.

Researchers

A number of different types of researcher can be discerned, including experts and consultants from international organisations, individual or team-based consultants, university researchers, public-sector researchers and international and national independent experts. Analysis of the documents found demonstrates that research agencies are in the lead where research output is concerned, with individual or team-based consultants close behind. Graph 1, which reflects data from Côte d’Ivoire, illustrates the trend encountered across all three countries.

Graph 1: Distribution of researchers in Côte d’Ivoire

Only scant interest in TVSD can be seen among academic researchers during the period 1991-2011. At the university level, the most common type of publication is end-of-course projects (at the Master’s and doctoral levels) produced through collaboration between students and tutors. This type of work constitutes 8% of the documents consulted in Côte d’Ivoire and 29% in Burkina Faso. Scientific publications make up a very low percentage of the overall output in these two countries: only 4% of the documents examined in Burkina Faso and 0% of those used in Côte d’Ivoire were of this type (TVSD appeared in neither the École normale supérieure’s (ENS) Revue Ivoirienne des Sciences de l’Éducation nor the Institut pédagogique national de l’enseignement technique et professionnel’s (IPNETP) Revue des Sciences et Technologie during the past decade). At the sub-regional level, the ERNWACA (JERARE) journal, first published in 2008, has featured not a single article on TVSD.4

---

4 It is to be observed, however, that 10% of the small research grants awarded by ERNWACA over the course of the past five years look at the links between education and employment.
The studies carried out in Burkina Faso, Côte d’Ivoire and Ghana thus indicate that while TVSD was once off-limits to certain groups, this is now no longer the case and it is produced outside universities by consultancy firms which have recourse to the skills of university researchers.

Like in the three countries under study, academic research makes up only a small proportion of the studies carried out in Latin America and South Africa. The most common studies are those commissioned by government and international bodies. It is worth noting, however, that in South Africa, research on TVSD has seen a significant increase since 2003. In Latin America, the work of public- and private-sector research centres is supported by the national academic research system and/or by universities.

**Determinants of research output**

In the three West African countries under study, the majority of research is commissioned (Graph 2). Most studies are carried out fragmentarily and seek merely to respond to isolated concerns identified by donors in concert with governments. This commissioned research is mostly financed by the government through (i) national vocational training institutions and (ii) technical and financial partners (TFPs): this is the case for 53% and 28% of the studies found in Côte d’Ivoire respectively. In Côte d’Ivoire, the main active international donors observed in the field of TVSD are the World Bank, the ADB and the ILO at the multilateral level and the AFD, as well as the GTZ, at the bilateral level. In Burkina Faso, the main donors are the World Bank, the UNDP, the ILO and UNICEF at the multilateral level and the AFD and the cooperation agencies of Austria, Switzerland, Luxembourg, Taiwan and Denmark at the bilateral level.

Expertise is contracted in (from consultancy firms, research companies or independent consultants) in line with the rules on public procurement for intellectual services or by a process of mutual agreement. This constrains the liberty granted to consultants, who do not enjoy an entirely free rein in the analyses which they produce. Furthermore, an examination of research areas demonstrates a certain conformism which seeks to reflect the needs of those commissioning the research. The fields explored by researchers are therefore the fruit of chance rather than any given research policy.

**Graph 2: Determinants of research output in Côte d’Ivoire**

Recherche suscitée = provoked research
Recherche heuristic = heuristic research
Recherche en réseau = network research

*Source: study data*
Topics addressed

The three case studies carried out in West Africa reveal that the research topics addressed are clustered around matters relating to the internal functioning of training systems or trends in the types of topics put forward by development partners over the years. So, too, does research focus on one-off studies which lead to projects bearing little relation to systemic policymaking.

The most frequently recurring topics dealt with in Burkina Faso (Table 4) relate to analysis of the institutional and regulatory framework and curriculum design, which formed the focus of 42% of studies. Next come training issues and roles (17%), training-employment fit (11%) and ongoing training (9%). Only 1% of the studies in our sample deal with topics relating to research on education and training, training outcomes, access to TVSD research and even funding for research on TVSD.

Table 4: Distribution of sample studies dating from 1990 to 2010 in Burkina Faso by topic

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topics addressed</th>
<th>Number of studies</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training system, curriculum design and training programmes</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training issues and roles</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training-employment fit (relevance)</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ongoing training in organisations</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment prospects for graduates from the training system</td>
<td>08</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advice and guidance as part of training</td>
<td>08</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Funding for training</td>
<td>04</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to training</td>
<td>03</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effects or impact of training</td>
<td>03</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research on education and training</td>
<td>02</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>03</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>151</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: study data

The topics addressed in Ghana relate mainly to coordination of TVET, access to TVET, funding, the setting-out and implementation of policies, the training environment (infrastructure, quality of training and trainer qualifications) and the ongoing stigmatisation of vocational as opposed to general courses.

In the case of Côte d’Ivoire (Graph 3), the most common research focus is ongoing training, which can be explained by the fact that the main national training agency, known as the Vocational Training Development Fund (*Fonds de développement de la formation professionnelle*, FDFP), has commissioned a number of studies to identify needs in terms of on-the-job training. Training in the
education sector occupies second place in the list of issues tackled by research. Topics relating to labour-market entry and informal activities are seldom focused upon in research, however.

**Graph 3: Distribution of topics focused upon in Côte d’Ivoire by type of researcher**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Researcher</th>
<th>Continuing education</th>
<th>Training in informal activities</th>
<th>Training in educational sector</th>
<th>Integration into labour-market</th>
<th>Continuing education and training in informal activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expert/int consultant</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual/team-based</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>consultant</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academics</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research agency</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inter + nat independent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>expert</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: study data*

Given the pivotal role played by national government entities, international organisations and multilateral banks in commissioning research, the topics which arise most frequently in studies are directly linked to the implementation of those bodies’ strategies. This is also true in Latin America, where education and vocational skill development, secondary and tertiary technical instruction and vocational or work-related training policy and/or programme evaluation are at once the areas most commonly focused upon in the studies encountered and those highlighted in reforms implemented since the 1990s.

In South Africa, meanwhile, the main focuses of research are the analysis of businesses’ training needs, coherence at the institutional, systemic and political levels, disconnects between education and the labour market, the misalignment between training and the National Qualifications Framework, the impact of the apprenticeship system, structural, management and recruitment efficiencies, and the ability of human resources to deal with institutional reforms.

**Research approaches**

The studies identified and analysed show that the same research approaches are favoured across all three West African countries being examined here. Côte d’Ivoire serves as an example of this. Economics (macro- and microeconomics) is the most commonly adopted approach. Other common approaches are education (training system and pedagogical and didactic concerns), which is the case
in 14% of the studies identified, and social anthropology (behaviour within organisations), which applies to 8% of the studies examined.

These studies subscribe to the action-research model in Burkina Faso, whereas in Côte d’Ivoire they favour a diagnostic approach over a critical one.

**Graph 4: Disciplinary approaches in research in Côte d’Ivoire**

![Disciplinary approaches in research in Côte d’Ivoire](image)

*Source: study data*

The disaggregation of stakeholders by research area (Graph 5) shows that studies taking a largely economics-based approach are in the majority, even going so far as to monopolise contributions coming from all quarters except consultants. The latter group produces the most diverse body of research, and is the only one to espouse social anthropology as a research approach.

**Graph 5: Distribution of research approaches by stakeholder group in Côte d’Ivoire**

![Distribution of research approaches by stakeholder group in Côte d’Ivoire](image)

*Source: study data*

The economic perspective is crucial with TVSD given its close links to the world of work and industry. However, the fact that this approach prevails in more than three quarters of all studies means that
there is little room remaining for the other approaches necessary to an analysis of the field, namely education and social anthropology, but also socio-linguistics, law, (institutional and economic) history, the political sciences, demography and statistics. Questions may also be raised about the ability of those producing the larger part of the research, namely consultants and research agencies, to promote an inter-disciplinary approach, where a team of researchers from different disciplines works together.

West Africa is not the only region to witness a predominantly macroeconomic approach to TVSD analysis. We must examine this trend further, however, for as McGrath recalls, “Yet, skills systems are filled with people and learners are ultimately at the heart of TVET. This clearly raises methodological issues regarding whose perspectives are reflected by research and which of the multiple relevant knowledges about TVET are privileged and which silenced”. (McGrath, 2011).

In Latin America, the evaluation of vocational training policies and programmes makes up the majority of the studies in our survey. Most of these evaluations relate to matters of external efficiency and monitor the progress of training programme alumni to assess how different courses influence employment and employability. Many studies also analyse reforms in technical secondary education implemented in a number of Latin American countries since the beginning of the 2000s and the emergence of tertiary-level technical education. Such evaluations tackle a section or sub-section of the education system, though there are also studies which seek to analyse the entire TVSD system.

Research produced by academics stands out in that it has more frequent recourse to qualitative methods and tends to examine the hypotheses upon which policies are based, which other types of studies decline to question. Some studies, for example, analyse (a) stakeholders’ experiences over time and their strategies concerning the training system, (b) policy implementation and the role of the stakeholders who take part in this at the different levels of the programmes, (c) the socio-political and cultural context in which programmes are implemented, and (d) the links between discourse and action at the different levels of the system.

While assessments are based on human capital theory, academic research strives to highlight the social benefits which may be on offer to students on training programmes in addition to the economic advantages. Other studies hone in on the links between level of education, training on offer and job prospects. They highlight the complexity of young people’s entry into the labour market and underscore that education alone cannot create jobs. Two further focuses of academic research are the links between TVET and general teaching, and training outside the confines of formal structures, particularly in the informal sector.

**Research trends over the past 20 years**

Research output statistics for Burkina Faso over the past 20 years (Table 5) show that the second decade of that period saw an increase in research output: 74% of all the studies in our sample were published between 2000 and 2010.

| Table 5: Research output in Burkina Faso (number of studies) by five-year period from 1990 to 2010 |
|--------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| Number of publications                            | 19        | 20        | 51        | 61        | 151   |
| Percentage                                       | 13%      | 13%      | 34%      | 40%      | 100% |

*Source: study data*
In the case of Côte d’Ivoire, analysis of research trends reveals a turnaround in thematic priorities (Graph 6). At the beginning of the 1990s, concerns related mainly to ongoing training and, to a lesser extent, education, while the first decade of the 21st century saw fundamental issues relating to the management of the education/training system return to the fore. Following a period in which concerns about the global competitiveness of the Ivorian economy and, later, how to deal with the social impact of economic, social and political crises, there has been a renewed interest in education and training.

Beyond that general trend, however, the graph highlights three noteworthy trends in the topics focused upon in research:

- Ongoing training was the main area of research until the end of the 1990s, but then suffered a sharp decline;
- Following social responses to unemployment (National Employment Plan, 1991; Policy on Social Funding, 1995; Employment Revitalisation Plan, 2000) and the years of social and political crisis, the issue of labour market entry came to the fore. This research area then lost ground, however, to education-related programmes and activities such as the Disarmament, Demobilisation and Reintegration (DDR) project.
- Only scant research focuses on informal work, despite this sector’s economic significance.

Graph 6: Research topics and their development in Côte d’Ivoire

The study carried out in South Africa offers an interesting analysis of the way in which research on TVSD has developed since the fall of apartheid. Three periods can be discerned: ‘The Construction Period’, ‘Early Criticism’ and ‘Deconstruction: A New Phase’. The first of these periods lasted from 1994 to 2003. It was characterised by the close proximity of research output and policy
implementation. Skills development found itself at the heart of post-apartheid development strategy, and the priority was the production of (mainly quantitative) data on which to base new TVSD policies, which were intended to replace the segregated system used under apartheid. Para-state organisations, private institutions and, to a lesser extent, universities were the main research drivers. This was also the period during which systems were put in place to produce data on businesses’ needs.

The second period, which stretched from 2003 to 2009, was one of policy implementation. Research and policies began to move apart from one another. Academic research also increased on a significant scale, and adopted a critical stance on the policies being implemented. A number of the hypotheses upon which policies were based were called into question, including the links between education and economic growth, education and poverty and education and work. This initial period of criticism was extended, after 2009, with that of ‘Deconstruction: A New Phase’. This saw researchers and political decision-makers move closer together, and a certain distancing from the corpus of data produced in the previous periods was also observed.
RESEARCH EXPECTATIONS, NEEDS AND DEMANDS

By analysing the information gathered from education and training policymakers, providers of funding and technical assistance, sources of training/trainers and recipients, we can identify the expectations, needs and demands in existence where TVSD research is concerned.

In Burkina Faso, study-related demand can be identified on three levels:

- Sector-based studies to shed light on present and future difficulties, potential opportunities and, above all, present and future needs where required skills and qualifications are concerned;
- Curriculum and training programme design;
- Alumni tracking to garner data on their progress and assess the quality of the content of their training programmes.

In Côte d’Ivoire, the interviews reveal six categories of expectations, needs and demands, listed here in order of priority: (i) Quality of training; (ii) Governance, institutions and partnerships; (iii) Awareness of the labour market; (iv) Curriculum reform; (v) Collaborative research; (vi) Certification.

The documents analysed for Ghana highlight five categories of research expectations, needs and demands which help the following objectives to be implemented:

- To create a system which provides a flexible supply of human resources which can adapt to labour-market trends;
- To produce a qualified, high-quality workforce which will allow Ghana’s industries, products and services to compete more successfully on local and global markets;
- To boost the income of the most vulnerable in particular by offering training, lifelong learning and integration into the modern economy;
- To help increase revenue from international trade by fostering a regionally and internationally mobile qualified workforce;
- To help maintain economic and political stability.
PRIORITY RESEARCH FOCUSES AND PREREQUISITES

The data on Burkina Faso allow us to identify 14 priority research areas which can be sorted into four categories (Table 6). The most frequently arising suggestions for research are those which take into account demand, supply and management. Matters relating to TVSD in the informal and agriculture sectors and in women’s entrepreneurship remain niche research interests, despite the fact that these two aspects exert a major influence on the national economy.

Table 6: Distribution of priority research areas in Burkina Faso

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demand</th>
<th>Supply and management</th>
<th>Training didactics</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Quality of training offered</td>
<td>The issue of funding for training, and especially public-private partnerships</td>
<td>New curriculum design</td>
<td>How to use research findings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Determiners of demand for training</td>
<td>Provision for labour-market entry support</td>
<td>Implementing the skills-based approach</td>
<td>The informal sector and training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obstacles to accessing vocational training</td>
<td>Provision for labour-market entry support</td>
<td></td>
<td>Women’s entrepreneurship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of trades and professions</td>
<td>Decentralisation and vocational training</td>
<td></td>
<td>Relevant innovation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: study data

Regarding Ghana (Table 7), future research under the aegis of TVET revolves around:

- General matters concerning subject preferences and discrimination between science and technology;
- Teaching methods in science and technology;
- ‘Classical’ funding, institutional management, training and its relevance to and links with the business world, and teaching strategies which foster the marriage of training and learning.
Table 7: Distribution of priority research areas in Ghana

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topics</th>
<th>Potential research questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Science and technology</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Social sciences versus hard sciences in schools | Why do students choose social sciences over hard sciences?  
   Have the links between science teaching at the primary, secondary and tertiary levels been sufficiently adapted?  
   Which labour-market needs exist?  
   Should the current ratio of 60:40 of social sciences to hard sciences be maintained in teaching?  
   How does the above affect labour-market trends in Ghana? |
| Science teaching in schools    | How can one ensure that laboratories are paid the attention which they require, bearing in mind that there is little chance that major sources of funding for this will suddenly become available?  
   How can establishments ensure that equipment is maintained and/or updated?  
   Are methods available to teachers which do not depend so heavily on workshops? |
| **TVET**                      |                                                                                                                                                                |
| Funding for the TVET sub-sector | How can sustainable and predictable funding be ensured for TVET and the work of the Council for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (COTVET)?  
   Can COTVET increase its own funds? If so, how? |
| Learning structure             | Is the current learning model the best key for the future?  
   Should emphasis be placed on something other than free training, salaries and toolboxes?  
   How can the adequate training of master craftspeople be guaranteed?  
   What are the inter-sectoral implications of this set-up, and how can the system be efficiently monitored and evaluated? |
| Relevance of TVET              | Are TVET graduates the type of graduates that employers look for? Can technical training fulfil employers’ needs to an adequate degree? Are the current curriculum and equipment out of date? What progress is being made with attempts to revise the curriculum? How can instructors remain abreast of industry needs so as to ensure that they produce sufficiently qualified graduates? How can links between staff and students be harnessed to make technical training more relevant? How can industry resources be used to improve relevance and quality? |
| COTVET’s role                  | How can COTVET efficiently manage and coordinate service providers in the TVET sub-sector to ensure coherence and efficiency?  
   COTVET’s role and responsibilities have been clearly laid out, but what is the best way to ensure that COTVET has the ability and the authority to perform the functions entrusted to it? What role is the private sector expected to play in COTVET and how can this contribution be bolstered and streamlined?  
   What clear responsibilities should be handed to the ministries and agencies to improve TVET at the country level and improve COTVET’s activities? |
In the case of Côte d’Ivoire (Table 8), future research on TVSD relates to three topics:

- Knowledge of the labour market and trades and professions, especially in the agriculture sector;
- Institutional management capacities and links between training and the business world;
- Relevant training strategies to strengthen TVSD.

**Table 8: Distribution of priority research areas in Côte d’Ivoire**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic 1: Knowledge of the labour market</th>
<th>Topic 2: Governance, institution and partnership</th>
<th>Topic 3: Quality of training</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employment-rich areas</td>
<td>Goal of training policy: labour-market entry or skill development</td>
<td>Type of collaboration between the professional world and training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Availability and accessibility of farmland</td>
<td>Donors’ contributions to skills development</td>
<td>Trainer training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture graduates’ career choices</td>
<td>Regions’ economic potential and developing vocational training</td>
<td>Pedagogical decisions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trades, professions and skills in agricultural training</td>
<td>The role of businesses in vocational training</td>
<td>Training-employment fit for the various agricultural roles in existence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Needs relating to skills and capacity building</td>
<td>Planning training and employment</td>
<td>Role of the professional sector in vocational training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Links between recruitment and employment</td>
<td>Students’ perceptions of TVET</td>
<td>Relevance of the training programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human resource capacity building in the informal sector</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocational training and institutional performance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour-market entry and redeployment of graduates</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The priority TVSD research areas across the three countries in question can be summarised in the following five main categories:

- TVSD offering and institutional management: funding, planning, regional training development, governance;
- Demand for training in terms of knowledge of productive activities and labour-market needs;
- Encouraging TVSD provision, particularly in the informal and agriculture sectors;
- Didactic and pedagogical strategies which involve designing curricula which are more pertinent and more closely adapted to industrial and economic developments;
- Graduate entry to the labour market.
CONCLUSION

The studies carried out in Burkina Faso, Côte d’Ivoire and Ghana demonstrate that the research commissioned by government institutions, international organisations and bilateral cooperation agencies maintains a clear lead in the field of TVSD. Research agencies and consultants produce the most research in these countries. Their output also happens to be complemented by the work of civil servants with academic backgrounds, whose main contributions are reports on the state of the labour market and policies to assist entry to it. Academic contributors are in a minority, which confirms that the region-wide trend of deinstitutionalisation of research in the social sciences is at play in the countries under study. As a result, the situation concerning TVSD research is characterised by a series of one-off, short-term studies, and these studies suffer from certain limitations in that their scope prevents any one study from covering a systemic issue such as TVSD in its entirety.

The most frequently addressed research topics are those which are directly linked to the policies and programmes being implemented by those commissioning the research. Macroeconomics is the most commonly adopted research framework.

Like in the three countries in question, commissioned research and the macroeconomic approach prevail in South Africa and Latin America. However, more academic publications are produced in those countries.

The studies carried out in West Africa reveal a gap between the research on offer and TVSD stakeholders’ priority research demands and expectations. The most widely desired topics which emerge from discussions with the stakeholders in question relate to:

- Institutional management: funding, planning, regional training development and governance;
- Analysis of demand for training in terms of knowledge of productive activities and labour-market needs;
- Improved understanding of the informal and agriculture sectors;
- Developing curricula which are more closely adapted to the context;
- Labour-market entry for graduates.

These priority research areas confirm that it is important to adopt a multi-disciplinary approach to TVSD-related matters. They also show that research is expected to propel the implementation of policies and programmes at various stages: when they are first laid out, particularly by providing data on trades and professions and labour-market needs, when they are implemented, so that context-specific curricula can be designed, and during follow-up, by providing analysis of graduate labour-market entry. Research also has a role to play in helping us to improve our understanding of the informal and agriculture sectors and to take these sectors more successfully into account, bearing in mind that they occupy such a central position in the economies of the three countries under study.

What determines whether research can meet the expectations and demands voiced by TVSD stakeholders? Firstly, both the Latin American study and the South African one underscore the importance of permanent mechanisms for providing information and monitoring, not only for political decision-making but also for researchers.

Secondly, facilitating academic research is a means of reducing the gap which this study highlights between the research available and the priority research areas mentioned by TVSD stakeholders. It certainly seems crucial to promote the emergence of a stable research community which is able to regenerate itself. The research commissioned by government institutions and international organisations is necessary to ensure that the policies and programmes which they fund and implement are monitored. Meanwhile, by prioritising a macroeconomic approach, they do not allow various different aspects of TVSD to be analysed, for this requires multidisciplinary research teams.
Qualitative research, which sets stakeholders at the heart of its analysis, is necessary, particularly when studying the informal and agriculture sectors, which are currently subject to widespread neglect. Furthermore, commissioned research, by definition, does not allow researchers to stand back from the assumptions upon which programmes and policies are based, which would allow their limitations to be identified and overcome. Finally, only a stable research community is fit to contribute to international discussions of the topic, and to analyse these and tailor them to the present circumstances at the national and regional levels.

The potential offered by academic research as opposed to the commissioned research produced by research agencies and consultants is significant given its ability to:

- Take into account various different dimensions of TVSD;
- Add to/call into question the quantitative data available by publishing qualitative evidence for how programmes and policies are implemented, how they affect recipients and how they are appropriated elsewhere;
- Improve knowledge of all too frequently neglected areas such as the informal and agriculture sectors;
- Appropriate international debates and policies and tailor them to the situation at the national level;
- Critically analyse the assumptions upon which policies and programmes are based, which allows them to be regenerated.

Given the way in which research is being deinstitutionalised across all three countries included in our survey, which platforms favour the development of a TVSD research community? Networks may provide one answer to this question, but their continuity and legitimacy require an institutional basis which currently fails to meet the needs in existence. The institutionalisation of academic research depends on the funding on offer for such research, which remains lacking and continues to fall short of the commitments made under the Lagos Action Plan (1980), which recommended that 1% of GDP be earmarked for this. Institutionalisation is also linked to the governance of university research and the dissemination of research findings.

The analysis carried out above allows the following observations to be made: firstly, the similarities encountered between the three West African countries under study, where TVSD research remains sparse, lead us to suggest that research findings should be shared through an online library. This joint effort would promote the sharing of results and allow the field to be more thoroughly understood in all three countries. It would thus allow common research plans to be identified and transnational studies of TVSD to be carried out.

Secondly, it would be worth confirming and clarifying the priority research agenda sketched out with TVSD stakeholders in West Africa by convening a regional forum with a view to setting up a platform to identify priorities for research programmes which might rally the human and financial resources necessary for their success. It would be beneficial for South African and Latin American researchers to attend this forum.

Finally, a number of lessons could be learned from networks which already exist in the region in other fields, particularly health and agriculture.
REFERENCES


APPENDIX : Documents consulted for each study

Documents consulted in Burkina Faso


Bamouni M.,(1990), Rôle de la chambre de commerce, de l’industrie et d’artisanat du Burkina (CCIAB) en matière de formation et d’assistance aux entreprises, 38p.


Batiebo Aline, (2009), Analyse des pratiques et outils de gestion des ressources humaines d’une unité de gestion de projet de développement cas de la cellule d’appui à la gestion commune (CAGEC), 134p.


Cellule d’appui à la formation professionnelle (2004), Programme de formation de l’ouvrier artisan menuisier métallique (niveau 1, 2, 3)

Cellule d’appui à la formation professionnelle (2004), Le référentiel de métier de l’ouvrier artisan mécanicien automobile

Cellule d’appui à la formation professionnelle (2004), Les référentiels de métiers de l’ouvrier artisan coiffeur
Cellule d’appui à la formation professionnelle (2004), Les référentiels de métiers de l’ouvrier artisan électricien bâtiment, 70p.

Cellule d’appui à la formation professionnelle (2004), Programme de formation de l’ouvrier artisan mécanicien deux roues (niveau 1, 2, 3)

Cellule d’appui à la formation professionnelle programme de formation (2004), Programme de formation de l’ouvrier artisan modéliste (niveau 1, 2, 3)

Cellule d’appui à la formation professionnelle, (2004), Programme de formation de l’ouvrier artisan automobile (niveau 1, 2, 3), 130p.

Cellule d’appui à la formation professionnelle, (2004) Programme de formation de l’ouvrier artisan coiffeur (niveau 1, 2)

Cellule d’appui à la formation professionnelle, (2004), Le référentiel de métier de l’ouvrier artisan mécanicien 02 roues

Cellule d’appui à la formation professionnelle, (2004), Programme de formation de l’ouvrier artisan maçon (niveau 1, 2, 3).


Cellule d’appui à la formation professionnelle, (2004), Le référentiel de métier de l’ouvrier artisan modéliste

Cellule d’appui à la formation, (2002), Programme de formation de l’ouvrier artisan menuisier ébénisterie (niveau 1, 2, 3) professionnelle.

Cellule d’appui à la formation, (2002), Programme de formation de l’ouvrier artisan électricité bâtiment (niveau 1, 2, 3) professionnelle, 150p.


Chambre de commerce (2009), Etat du secteur privé, Chambre de commerce 67 p.


Coulibaly J.M., 2005, Accès la formation professionnelle: l'apprentissage, une alternative crédible de formation au Burkina Faso, le cas de la ville de Ouagadougou, 152P.


DANIDA, (2005), Pratiques et expériences incorporant le préprofessionnel dans l’enseignement de base au Burkina Faso, 81 p.


Institut FORHOM, (2009), Formation sur catalogue clé en main, 28p


Marchal Y., (1992), Projet de formation de conseiller en formation continu, d’apprentissage en artisanal, formation de responsable de formation d’établissement technique, Centre Universitaire de coopération Economique et sociale CUCES, 8p


MESS (2007), L’enseignement technique et professionnel au Burkina Faso, Centre National de l’information de l’orientation scolaire et professionnelle (CIOSPB), 93p.


MESS (1999), Rapport de synthèse des travaux du comité de suivi du projet professionnalisation et emploi (PPE) : 4ème réunion tenue le lundi 05 Juillet, projet professionnalisation et emploi (PPE), 14p.


MESS (2005), National sur les enjeux et les priorités de l’Enseignement Technique et de la formation professionnelle au Burkina Faso R 32 25 (Bis), rapport d’atelier, Direction des Archives et de la documentation, 83p.

MESS (2007), L’enseignent technique et professionnelle au Burkina Faso, 93p.


MESSRS (1999), Atelier de formation orientations scolaire et professionnelle à Ouahigouya, rapport d’atelier, Direction des Archives et de la documentation, 18p.


33


MESSRS (2009), Schéma directeur de la politique nationale de l'enseignement et de la formation techniques et professionnels, 20 p.


Ministère de la Jeunesse et de l’Emploi/DGSPE (2010), Document Cadre pour la certification professionnelle au Burkina Faso, 40P.


MJE 2008, Politique Nationale de l’Emploi, 62p


ONEF, (2005), Répertoire des centres de formations professionnelles au BF, 17p.


ONEF, (2005), Recueil de données statistiques sur l’emploi au BF, PNUD, 125p.


Oouoba S. O., (2007), La contribution des centres de ressources à la formation continue des enseignants du primaire au BF : cas de la province de la Tapoa, mémoire ENAM, 48p.


Pare L. N., (2008), La gestion prévisionnelle des emplois et compétences : outils stratégiques de management pour la RTB, mémoire ENAM, 50p.

Pare L. N., (2008), La formation continue des personnels de santé de 1er échelon dans le district sanitaire de Ziniaré de 2004 à 2006 : analyse et perspectives, mémoire ENAM, 66 p.

Patrick B, (2005), Revue Internationale du Travail, BIT 262

Programme de renforcement de la formation Professionnelle ((PRFP), (2007), PRFP INFOS, Coopération Taiwanaise au Burkina, 18p.


Toe A.G., (2007), Les enjeux de la formation du personnel dans un monde de forte concurrence : cas de la société nationale des postes, 75P


**Documents consulted in Côte d’Ivoire**


Allé–Ando (2000), Rapport sur les besoins en formation à la gestion communautaire de l’environnement urbain en Côte d’Ivoire. FDFP.


Bomisso, I., G. (2008), Insertion professionnelle des diplômés du supérieur à Abidjan. Mémoire ENSEA.

C.O.3 (1998), Etude d’opportunités et de faisabilité relative à la réhabilitation et à l’implantation d’Unités Mobiles pour la Formation Continue. FDFP.

Cabinet ACA, Audit et Conseil en Afrique (2004), Etude des besoins en formation des acteurs de la filière café-cacao. FDFP.

Cabinet Afrique Formation Conseil Etude (2005), Etude de la formation et de l’insertion des personnes Handicapées. FDFP

Cabinet Afrique Formation Conseil Etude (2007), Etude des créneaux d’activités rentables et porteurs d’emploi de la commune de Yopougon. AGEPE.

Cabinet de consultant associés C.Y. (1996), Etude des besoins en formation dans le secteur de l’hôtellerie et du tourisme. FDFP.

Cabinet de consultants associés C.Y. (1996), Etude des besoins en formation dans le secteur de l’artisanat. FDFP.

Cabinet de consultants associés C.Y. (1997), Etude des besoins en formation des PME. FDFP.

Cabinet Déclic, Etude des besoins en formation dans le secteur de la boulangerie. FDFP

Cabinet ICA Conseil (2005), Contribution de la formation professionnelle au développement des systèmes productifs locaux. FDFP.

Cabinet JCM Consultants (1996), Projet d’étude des besoins de formation dans le sous secteur du pétrole et gaz. FDFP.
Cabinet SMC (2000), Etude relative à l’évaluation des besoins de formation dans le domaine de l’informatique et des NTIC. MESRS\FDFP.

Cabinet Visa Performance France (2001), Etude des besoins en formation des entreprises du secteur de la plasturgie en Côte d’Ivoire. Coopération française\FDFP.


Doho, L. (2007), L’insertion des jeunes déscolarisés, quel est l’apport de la formation par alternance. Mémoire ENSEA.


GCA Internationale (2006), Les besoins en formation dans le secteur du transport routier. FDFP.

Groupe alpani (2005), Etude des besoins de formation dans les secteurs de l’assainissement et de la protection de l’environnement. FDFP.

Horus-Courtaud (1997), Etude des modalités de financement de l’Apprentissage dans l’Artisanat, le secteur agricole et le secteur non structuré. FDFP.


Kouassi, P.; Simporé, M. & Koffi, P. (2009), Etude pour le développement de la culture et le traitement de l’anacarde dans les villages des communes de Toumodi et de Tiassalé. FDFP.

Maiten, B. & Bonas, I. (2001), Evaluation des besoins en formation du secteur agro-alimentaire de la Côte d’Ivoire. MESRS\FDFP\coopération française\PROSUP.


**Documents consulted in Ghana**


Background paper prepared for the study on “Linking Education Policy to Labor Market Outcomes.
World Bank: Washington.


Benson Adjei (ND) Lessons from the German Apprenticeship System for the Improvement of the Apprenticeship System in Ghana. Unpublished observations


By Rev. Prof. Daniel A. Nyarko (Rector, Takoradi Polytechnic) on the Occasion of the NABPTEX/Polytechnics Meeting Accra, 23rd March, 2011


COTVET (2009) - Report of the Technical Committee on the Harmonisation of Competency Based Training (CBT) in Ghana


COTVET/JICA Operationalisation of COTVET – Piloting of CBT (2009)


Djangmah (______)The Challenge of Further Vocationalizing University Education in Ghana: A Survey Of University Graduates.


GeSCI ICT in Education: Technical and Vocational Education and Training
http://www.gesci.org/technical-vocational-education-training.html

Ghana Education Reform and JICA TVETS Project (2002)


Ghana Government Portal ISD (Nana Ama Bonnah) Technical and Vocational Education, “Master Key” to Development


http://www.ghanansem.org/index.php


Ghana News Agency (GNA) (2003) Quality of technical education in Ghana said to be low


South Korea To Support Technical And Vocational Education In Ghana


Technical and vocational education being revamped


South Korea To Support Technical And Vocational Education In Ghana


GNA General News of Monday, 31 May 2010 Government reminded to invest in Technical and Vocational Education


______. (2003a) Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy (GPRS) Paper. An Agenda for Growth and


Report.


_______ (2010) Demand and Supply Factors in Skills Development in Ghana. Performance and

Recommendations for the Technical and Vocational Education and Training System (An unidentified Powerpoint presentation)

JICA / MOE The Study for Development of a Master Plan to Strengthen


MOE (2010) Education Sector Annual Review


Myjoyonline News (2010) (Technical and Vocational institutions to be accredited http://news.myjoyonline.com/


NACVET (2006) Response to Enquiries for TVET Project in Ghana


National Vocational Training Institute (2008) Budget


Participants Reference Material – Project Cycle Management PCM Workshop to formulate a Pilot CBT Project for consideration by the Governments of Ghana and Japan


Rapporteur’s Report on Education Roundtable on Introducing Competency Based Training (CBT) in

Ghana’s Technical, Vocational, Education and Training System – July 2005


Teacher Educational Division/Ghana Education Service (TED/GES) (2001) “Report on Teacher Training Colleges that Offer Technical Skills as a Subject”.


Technical Education in the Republic of Ghana

The Chronicle Jan 20, 2011 Ghana: Lack of Funding is Bane of Industries http://allafrica.com/ghana/201101200001.html

The Daily IJ (June 2010) Ghana: City & Guilds bemoans neglect of Technical/Vocational education http://inwent-ijj-lab.org/Weblog


UNESCO (2003) Synthesis of Main Findings From Two Case Studies Carried out in Ghana and Zambia on Private TVET (Phase II), IIEP: Paris


Unsourced ( ) Roadmap to give Formal/Self Employable Skills to Early Leavers of the Formal Education System (From Junior High School To Senior High School)

